

Resolution of Disputes Regarding the Election of Village Head in Villages in Pringgasela District, East Lombok Regency

Rachman Maulana Kafrawi 1*, Sarkawi 2, M. Saleh 3, HA. Khair 4, Antonino Pedro Marsal 5

- ¹ University of Mataram, , Indonesia, Email: rachmanmaulana@unram.ac.id
- ² University of Mataram, Indonesia, Email: sarkawi@unram.ac.id
- ³ University of Mataram, Indonesia, Email: saleh@unram.ac.id
- ⁴ University of Mataram, Indonesia, Email: khair@unram.ac.id
- ⁵ Oriental University of East Timor, Timor Leste, Email: antoniopedromarsal@gmail.com

Articcle Information

Article History:

Received: 16-01-2025Revised: 10-02-2025Accepted: 12-03-2025Published: 19-03-2025

Keyword:

Dispute Resolution; Legislation; Village Head Election;

Abstract

The implementation of the Village Head Election is also a manifestation of the community at the village level practicing direct politics. Based on Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages (Village Law), the regulation of village head elections begins with nomination, voting and determination. However, the regulation regarding the resolution of disputes over the results of village head elections is not included in the Village Law. The regulation regarding disputes over the results of village head elections is stated in Article 37 paragraph (6) of the Village Law. In this article, the authority to resolve disputes over the results of village head elections is the authority of the regent/ mayor. Furthermore, regarding the time period for resolving disputes over the results of village head elections for 30 (thirty) days. This research is based on reports of disputes over village head elections. For this reason, it is necessary to resolve disputes over village head elections in accordance with procedures and laws and regulations. This research is anormative research. The results of this study are expected to be the Settlement of Village Head Election Disputes in accordance with applicable Procedures and Laws.

Abstrak

Pelaksanaan Pilkades juga merupakan wujud bahwa masyarakat di tingkat desa melakukan praktik berpolitik secara langsung. Berdasarkan Undang-Undang Nomor 6 Tahun 2014 tentang Desa (UU Desa), pengaturan pemilihan kepala desa dimulai dari pencalonan, pemungutan suara dan penetapan. Namun, pengaturan mengenai penyelesaian perselisihan hasil pemilihan kepala desa tidak termuat dalam UU Desa. Pengaturan mengenai perselisihan hasil pilkades dicantumkan pada Pasal 37 ayat (6) UU Desa. Pada Pasal tersebut, kewenangan penyelesaian sengketa hasil pilkades merupakan kewenangan bupati/walikota. Selanjutnya mengenai jangka waktu penyelesaian sengketa hasil pilkades selama 30 (tiga puluh) hari. Peneltian ini didasarkan pada laporan adanya sengketa pemilihan kepala desa. Untuk itu diperlukan penyelesaian sengketa pemilihan kepala desa yang sesuai prosedur dan peraturan perundang-undangan. Penelitian ini merupakan penelitian normative dengan pendekatan undang-undang, pendekatan konseptual dan pendekatan kasus. Hasil penelitian ini diharapkan ialah Penyelesaian Sengketa Pemilihan Kepala Desa yang sesuai dengan Prosedur dan Peraturan perundang-undangan yang berlaku.

INTRODUCTION

Indonesia is a unitary state. This is based on the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia. The 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia also contains arrangement that the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia is divided on area provinces and regions province That shared on districts and cities where each province, district, and city has a regional government. Furthermore, in each district or city there are government units called villages and sub-districts.

Legally, the regulations regarding villages are determined in Article 18 B paragraph (2) of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia (UUD NRI 1945). In chapter the determined that the state recognizes and respects Unity public law custom along right traditional throughout Still there is and there isn't contradictory with principle or rules of the Republic of Indonesia. Rules about the village is also regulated in Constitution The village was enacted in 2014, in Article 1 number 1 it is explained that village is village and village custom or what is called with another name, where village is unity public law that has territorial boundaries and has authority for arrange affairs government and the interests of village communities.

The formation of the government in Indonesia is based on from existence village, where village has there is far away in Indonesia before the formation of the unitary state of Indonesia. ¹In building social institutions among villagers, the components used in its development consist of customary law, indigenous peoples, social structures, and local values. ²Evidence of the existence of villages that existed long before the formation of the Indonesian state can be seen in the explanation of Article 18 of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia before the amendment, it is explained that the territorial area of the State of Indonesia consists of villages in Java and Bali, nagari in Minangkabau, hamlets and

¹ Ananto Basuki and Shofwan, 2006, *Strengthening Government Village Based on Good Governance*, Secretariat Autonomy Village Faculty of Economics, Brawijaya University, Malang, p. 27.

² Sunu , IGKA (2014). Harmonization , Village Integration Customs with Multi-ethnic and Multi-religious Administrative Village Face Shift, Conservation, and Conflict in Bali. *Journal Knowledge Social and Humanities* , 3(2.

clans in Palembang and so on. These areas have an original structure, therefore these areas are special.

In Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning the village has regulations regarding the village head as stated in articles 26 to 47 which essentially explain the authority, rights and obligations, procedures for electing, and dismissing the village head. Likewise, in Government Regulation Number 11 of 2019 concerning the Implementing Regulations of Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages, there are regulations regarding the village head, namely starting from articles 40 to 60 which are more or less the same in regulating the authority, rights and obligations, procedures for electing, and dismissing the village head, but Government Regulation Number 11 of 2019 is more technical and detailed because it is an implementing regulation.

To carry out the functions of village authority in arrange his government, then need existence head village that can carry out function village government, this is emphasized in the Village Law. The village head has a significant role in regulating the implementation of the village government system in accordance with state regulations that have been mandated to the village head in order to create an independent and high-quality village.³

Village head elections are often abbreviated to with village head elections, maybe No foreign term Again For currently. As a forum to accommodate the political aspirations of the community as well as a means of changing or continuing the village government, the village head election is expected to be able to fulfill the desires and hopes of certain village communities, to appoint worthy candidates as village heads. The village head election is an instrument in the formation of a modern and democratic government. The democratic party held at the smallest regional level is basically regulated by government laws and regulations on how to organize the village head election.

So that the entire series of stages begins from formation committee village head election until the inauguration head village selected expected in accordance

 $^{^3}$ Roza, D., & Arliman , L. (2017). The Role of the Consultative Body Villages in Village Development and Supervision Finance Village . *Padjadjaran Journal of Law* , 4(3), 606-624.

with provisions that have been determined. This the process of electing the village head will run well without affecting the integrity of the community. And the community's hopes can be fulfilled for the election of a new village head and declared worthy to lead and run the village government. This is what every village community desires in order to achieve a conducive situation.

However, in practice, the village head elections have already been held regulated by law government for moment this is very difficult held smoothly and qualitatively because of the playing of elite political interest factors, interests to want to fight for power rather than the essence desired by the village head election, namely a legitimate village government. In addition, the implementation of the village head election is also touched and cannot be separated from the influence of village community cultures, so that culture often plays a role in it.

Based on the background that has been explained, the researcher tried to research the Settlement of Village Head Election Disputes in the Village, therefore the author felt interested in conducting research by raising the theme of "Resolution of Village Head Election Disputes in Villages in the Sub-district of "Pringgasela, East Lombok Regency".

RESEARCH METHODS

The type of research used is juridical normative, namely research based on regulations legislation or legal norms that are bind and have relevance to research discussed and applied. Study legal normative is research conducted based on material main law by examining theories, concepts, legal principles and laws and regulations related to this research. This approach is called the literature approach.

Meuwissen mentions two types of Legal Science, namely: Dogmatic Legal Science and Empirical Legal Science. Based on difference type knowledge law This

 $^{^4}$ Peter Mahmud Marzuki, $Research\ Law\ (Edition)\ Revision$), Charisma Son Main, Jakarta , 2005, p.93.

also has implications for differences method research used Good from side characteristic and object his research.⁵

Likewise, Bernard Arief Sidharta expressed that activity development knowledge law That always involves two aspects, namely rules law and facts (social reality), and that in the development process these two aspects interact with each other and must be interacted with.⁶

Hamid S Attamimi stated that science law No Once become knowledge normative pure and never becomes a pure social science, because law can come from sollen -sein and can also come from sein- sollen. In principle, law always contains aspects of ideals and reality, or in other words, law contains normative and empirical aspects.⁷

With this *socio-legal research*, it is hoped that researchers will be able to describe the problems raised in more depth and holistically. Because *socio-legal research* does not only focus on empirical research but also combines both aspects. namely normative and empirical.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

A. Completion Dispute Election Head Village by the Regional Government of East Lombok Regency

Understanding Village Head Election new found in Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 112 of 2014 (Permendagri No. 112 of 2014) concerning Election Head Village as act carry on from Regulation Government Number 43 of 2014 was formulated that election head village is "implementation" people's sovereignty in the village in frame choose head village which is direct, general, free, confidential, honest and fair ".8"

⁵ Soetando Wignyosoebroto, Without Years, Laws and Methods The study. p. 228.

 $^{^6}$ Bernard Arief Sidharta , 2007, Legal Development , Legal Science , Legal Theory and Legal Philosophy , published by PT. Refika Aditama . Bandung . p . 193

 $^{^{7}}$ A. Hamid S Attamimi , 1992, Speech Inauguration of Professor , University of Indonesia, Jakarta, p . 18.

⁸Article 1 paragraph (5) of the Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 112 of 2014 concerning Election Head Village (State Gazette of the Republic of Indonesia 2014 Number 2092).

If you look closely understanding election head village in a way juridical, linear with understanding election head regions (governors, regents / mayors), even election general in general For choose members of the DPR, members of the DPD, the President and Vice President, and members of the DPRD, namely contains 3 (three) elements:

- a. First, as means or implementation people's sovereignty;
- b. The position to be held filled (head village, chief regions, President and Vice President, and members of the DPR, DPD and DPRD); and
- c. The principle that becomes base implementation: LUBER and Jurdil (direct, general, free, secret, honest and fair).

In Constitution Number 6 of 2014, Article 37 paragraph (6) only determine " in matter happen dispute results election Head Village, Regent / Mayor must finish dispute in term time as referred to in paragraph (5)", while in paragraph (5) of Article 37, the determine maximum time 30 (twenty) days since date received delivery results election from committee election Head Village. So Article 37 paragraph (5) and paragraph (6) of the Law Number 6 of 2014 only determine who is authorized, namely Regent / Mayor and term the time allocated, namely 30 twenty) days For finish dispute results Village Head Election, meanwhile what are the related procedures, methods and mechanisms with the solution results election to village No set up The same very. ¹⁰

Likewise the Regulations Government Number 43 of 2014 in conjunction with the Regulations Government Number 47 of 2015 as act carry on from Law Number 6 of 2014 also does not arrange problem settlement dispute results Village Head Election. In Regulation Government This only There are 7 (seven) articles, namely: Articles 40 to 45. with Article 46 which regulates procedure problem election head village and only 1 (one) verse, namely Article (7) of Article 41, the norm of which is The same with Article 37 paragraph (6) of the Republic of Indonesia Law Number 6 of 2014, namely: " in matter happen dispute results

 $^{^9} Supriyadi,$ Juridical Studies Completion Election Result Dispute Head Village , Journal Legal Horizons , DOI: https://doi.org/10.26905/idjch.v10i2.3541.

¹⁰ *Ibid* .

election head Village, regent / mayor must finish dispute in term time 30 (twenty) days ".11

As act carry on from Regulation Government Number 43 of 2014, the Minister of Home Affairs issued Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 112 of 2014 as amended with Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 65 of 2021. Minister of Home Affairs Regulation This issued special For arrange problem election head village, but it is very unfortunate of the 50 (fifty) articles contained in This Minister of Home Affairs Regulation precisely No mentioned a bit about problem settlement dispute results Village head elections, especially solution to violation of the implementation process Village Head Election.

If There is offensive provisions problem related solutions with implementation election head village in general, it is also very vague as arranged in Article 5 paragraph (2) letter f Minister of Home Affairs Regulation No. 112 of 2014 as one of the task Committee Village Head Election level district/city that determines that "the committee elections in the Regency / City have task among them is facilitate settlement problem election head village level district / city". Of course, the provisions the still very vague What do you mean by "facilitating settlement problem election head village level district / city". ¹³

Election Head Village in a way implemented simultaneously government area East Lombok Regency according to the message contained in Constitution Number 6 of 2014 Concerning Village, then furthermore poured out in form Regional Regulations that become runway law implementation Election Head Village In general Simultaneously in East Lombok Regency, namely, East Lombok Regency Regional Regulation Number 4 of 2015 concerning Procedures for Election and Dismissal Head Village, as regulation implementation from bylaw the so set up Again in form Regulation Regent namely Regulation East Lombok Regent Regulation Number 15 of 2016 Concerning Regulation Implementation Regional Regulation of East Lombok Regency Number 4 of 2015 Concerning Procedures for Election and Dismissal Head Village.

¹¹ Ibid

 $^{^{12}}$ Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Country Number 65 of 2017 Concerning Change Ministerial regulation In Country Number 112 of 2014 Concerning Election Head Village . 13 Ibid .

Based on Constitution Number 6 of 2014 Concerning Village, authority for do inauguration namely is at in hand Regent. This is confirmed in Article 37 of the Village Law the has mentioned that:

- (1) Candidate for Head The declared village selected is candidates who obtain voice the most;
- (2) Committee election Head Village set candidate Head Village selected;
- (3) Committee election Head Village convey Name candidate Head Village selected to the Consultative Body Village maximum 7 (seven) days after determination candidate Head Village selected as referred to in paragraph (2);
- (4) Consultative Body Village maximum 7 (seven) days after accept report committee election convey Name candidate Head Village selected to Regent / Mayor;
- (5) Regent / Mayor to validate candidate Head Village selected as referred to in paragraph (3) becomes Head Villages no later than 30 (twenty) days since date received delivery results election from Committee election Head Village in form decision Regent / Mayor;
- (6) In matter happen dispute results election Head Village, Regent / Mayor must finish dispute in term time as referred to in paragraph (5). Furthermore authority regent For do inauguration mentioned Article 38 Paragraph (1) states: Candidates for Head Village selected inaugurated by the Regent / Mayor or appointed officials no later than 30 (twenty) days after issuance of the Regent / Mayor's Decree.

Determination candidate selected If There is between candidate head the village that has voice The same as provision Regional Regulation East Lombok Regency Number 4 of 2015 namely "In Head Candidate Matters The village that received voice the same majority, determination of the Candidate for Head Village Selected based on acquisition area more sound calculated area based on amount acquisition voice the most and the distribution of TPS is wider many. If still obtained voice the most and the same distribution of TPS, determination candidate head village selected set based on voice the most at TPS with amount voters the most".

Regulation the executor who regulates Regional Regulation Number 4 of 2015, namely in provision Article 56 of the Regulations East Lombok Regent Regulation Number 15 of 2016 Concerning Implementation Regional Regulation Number 4 of 2015 Concerning Procedures for Election and Dismissal Head Village arrange the same thing in determination candidate selected with the same voice No to describe in a way technical and detailed like What should determination candidate voice The same the done. Even in committee election level regency No There is the rules that govern matter voice The same said, so that cause different interpretations from candidate head village.

Several changes to the regulations on village head elections have been made up to now, since the enactment of Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages (hereinafter abbreviated as the Village Law), the government has regulated that village head elections will be held together or simultaneously like regional head elections (pilkada), these provisions are regulated in provisions of Article 31 paragraph (1) of the Village Law. Furthermore, in the implementing regulations of the Village Law, namely in the provisions of Article 40 paragraph (1) and (2) of the Government Regulation (hereinafter abbreviated as PP) Number 43 of 2014 concerning Villages2, which states, paragraph (1) "Village head elections are held simultaneously in all districts/cities", while paragraph (2) states "Simultaneous village head elections as referred to in paragraph (1) can be held in waves a maximum of 3 (three) times within a period of 6 (six) years".

Based on this, the Minister of Home Affairs as the executor of duties and functions (hereinafter abbreviated as tufoksi) who manages regional government and the village government issues a Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs (hereinafter abbreviated as Minister of Home Affairs Regulation) Number 112 of 2014 Concerning Village Head Elections, as stated in Article 2, "Village Head Elections are conducted simultaneously once or can be in waves". Furthermore, Article 4 paragraph (2) states, "Village Head Elections in waves as referred to in paragraph (1) are conducted a maximum of 3 (three) times within a period of 6 (six) years". And paragraph (3) states, "Village Head Elections in waves as referred to inin paragraph (2) is carried out at intervals of no more than 2 (two) years."

So that the implementation of village head elections must be carried out simultaneously throughout the region. district or city, by stipulating the Regional Regulation (Perda) of East Lombok Regency Number 4 of 2015 concerning Procedures for the Election and Dismissal of Village Heads, Article 4 state:

- 1) Simultaneous village head elections as referred to in Article 3 letter a are held throughout the region.
- 2) Simultaneous village head elections as referred to in paragraph (1) may be held in waves a maximum of 3 (three) times within a period of 6 (six) years.
- 3) The wave-based election of Village Heads as referred to in paragraph (2) is carried out with a maximum time interval of 2 (two) years.
- 4) Simultaneous village head elections were held for the first time in 2016.
- 5) The schedule for holding simultaneous Village Head elections is determined by the Regent upon the recommendation of the district election committee.

One of the basic principles of village head elections is direct, general, free and secret democracy, which has been known as LUBER, as 1. The implementation of village head the principles of the General Election since 1971¹⁴ must truly be in accordance with produce democratic leaders substantively and procedurally. So that in order to implement this, it is important to have clear and consistent rules in the implementation of village head elections, including dispute resolution mechanisms that will definitely occur. Because the joint record of conflicts that often occur in Indonesia is partly due to the election process, both regional heads and village heads. It always starts from a process of dissatisfaction one of the candidates who lost in the election.

29

¹⁴ Basri Mulyani and Zainul Fikri, Voting Behavior: Analysis of the High Number of Invalid Ballots (Study Case Study of Mataram City), Research Results Report, http://repository.gac,id:1015/id/eperint/18, (accessed February 25, 2025).

If the village head election process is ongoing and has been completed, then the vote counting stage becomes the main point of the election, until the process of appointing the Elected Village Head. On the other hand, if there is a dispute over the results of the village head election vote count, a fair and transparent resolution institution is needed in its implementation. Which institution must truly understand the law of general elections and the dispute resolution process according to statutory regulations so that the resulting decision is truly in accordance with the sense of justice of the community seeking a leader.

B. Settlement of Village Head Election Disputes at the State Administrative Court

From settings the No clear mechanism settlement regulated dispute from Regional Regulation Number 4 of 2015 in conjunction with the Regent Regulation Number 15 of 2016. So that interpretation on rule the cause dispute more carry on to Mataram State Administrative Court, Masdar as candidate head the village that feels disadvantaged from side rule in a way administrative state The Regent of East Lombok has violate Principles General Good government. As for the Aasa-the principles General Good governance (AUPB) which is violated as in argument his lawsuit is: 15

- a) The Principle of Legal Certainty, what is meant by the Principle of Legal Certainty law is principle prioritize regulation legislation, certainty law and justice, in every policy state administrators, Principle of certainty law Already Become rules law as mentioned in articles 8. 9, and 10. Law Number 30 of 2014, concerning Administration Government, with existence principle This a decision must be formulated in a way clear and firm, so that the decision conveyed No cause various interpretation.
- b) Principle Justice and Fairness, which is meant principle This is willekeureg or common sense state forbidden a action, which if the

 $^{^{\}rm 15}$ Decision Panel of Judges at Mataran Administrative Court Number : 08/G/2018/PTUN Mtr

- governing body contradictory with principles this, then action That the can be canceled .
- c) Principle Interest General, meant with principle interest general.
- d) (AUPB) is the principle of priority welfare general with method aspiring, accommodating and selective.

As has been described above, where in the reality No existence strict rules in regulation legislation from level center until rule implementation at the level areas that are firm arrange mechanisms and procedures for the settlement process dispute Village Head Election at level villages formed by the BPD or Committee District level village head elections were formed Regent, no capable give solution on problem both related with the process and results. Even Committee Election Head District Level Village only give answer on application dispute without inspect complaint submitted by the complainant.

Based on Article 58 Paragraph (1) of the Regulations East Lombok Regent Regulation Number 15 of 2016 Concerning Regulation Regional Implementation Regulation Number 4 of 2015 Concerning Procedures for Election and Dismissal Head Village stated as following Article (1): objection to determination results Election Head Village only can submitted by the Head Village to Regent in latest time three day after determination results election. That let go from authority Regent For to finish object to results calculation sound, no there is Regulation as base existence Administrative appeal submission to settlement dispute results calculation voice besides Basic Rules regarding effort administrative in the form of submission letter objection (written). Legal remedies that can be taken on dissatisfaction to results settlement object the is can submitted lawsuit State Administrative Court as court level first, with Submitted Committee Decision Election Head Village.

CONCLUSION

The procedures and mechanisms carried out by the Regent of East Lombok in settlement dispute on Election Head Village that is with Notice input from Committee Election Head Village, BPD, Subdistrict Head, and Team formed by the Regent. And if after settlement the dispute carried out by the Regent of East

Lombok, is still there is submission object on determination candidate Head village selected so inauguration candidate head Village Selected still implemented. Problems Village head elections at the level district, can carried out by the committee election head village level district, as set up in Article 5 paragraph (2) letter f of the Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 112 of 2014 which regulates repeat in Article 6 paragraph (2) letter f of East Lombok Regency Regional Regulation Number 4 of 2015. However in a way rule technical namely Regulation Regent Number 15 of 2016 Article 58 paragraph (4) only limited to rule with consider suggestions and opinions committee formed by the Regent in to cut off case whereas the fact inspection to the party submitting the application object No Once done. Settings election head village at level Regency as act carry on from Constitution about Village and regulations its implementation containing about obligation committee election convey determination results acquisition the voice that determines candidate selected to candidate (s) for head village, besides to BPD, mechanisms and procedures submission object according to the specified time limit, obligations regent / mayor or the team formed For bring together the disputing parties, and if No happen agreement, then regent / mayor together the team formed must finish dispute Results. Rules technical This important made immediately by the government East Lombok district. The Supreme Court needs to make guidelines technical settlement dispute election head village. so that there is guide for judges at the level First For finish case Village Head Election as case The regional elections have already been set up in Perma.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books:

Arief Sidharta, Bernard, 2007, Pengembanan Hukum, Ilmu Hukum, Teori Hukum dan Filsafat Hukum, terbitan PT. Refika Aditama. Bandung.

Attamimi, A. Hamid S, 1992, Speech Inauguration of Professor, University of Indonesia, Jakarta.

Basiang, Martin, 2016, *The Contemporary Law Dictionary*, PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama: Jakarta.

- Department For Work and Pensions, 2017, Financial Redress for Maladministration, cited from A'an Efendi and Freddy Poernomo, Administrative Law, Sinar Graphics, Jakarta.
- Isra, Saldi in the Foreword by Zainal Arifin Mochtar, 2017, *Independent State Institutions: Dynamics Development and Urgency Its Reorganization After Amendment Constitution* I, Rajawali Press: Jakarta.
- Jhonny Ibrahim, Theory and Methodology Normative Legal Research, Pusaka: Jakarta.
- Lotulung, Paulus Effendie, 2013, *State Administrative Law and Power*, Salemba Humanika: Jakarta.
- Lukman, Media, 2013, Service Agency General from Bureaucracy Going to Corporation, Bumi Aksara: Jakarta.
- Manan, Bagir in the Foreword book Taufiqukohman, 2015, Optimization Improvement Investigation of the Republic of Indonesia Ombudsman to Improve Quality Public Service, Publisher Faculty Knowledge Social and Science Politics of Prof. Dr. Moestopo University Religion; Jakarta.
- Nurtjahjo, Hendra et.al., 2013, *Understanding Maladministration*, Ombudsman of the Republic of Indonesia, Jakarta.
- Rhode, quoted from A'an Efendi and Freddy Poernomo, See dissertation Yvonne Maria van der Vlugt, De Nationale ombudsman en behavior politieoptrede, (de Universiteit Leiden, 2011).
- Ridwan HR and Nurmalita Ayuningtyas Harahap, 2018, *Civil Service Law*, UII Press: Yogyakarta.
- Rod Hague and Martin Harrop, 2001, Comparative Government and Politics: An Introduction, Palgrave: New York.
- Shidarta, Arief. 2009. Reflection About Structure Legal Science, Mandar Maju : Bandung.
- Soetandyo Wignyosoebroto, Without Years, Laws and Methods His study. Rays Graphics: Jakarta.
- Widodo, Joko, 2001, Good Governance, Human Scholar: Surabaya.

Journals and Scientific Papers:

- Alexander, Larry. *Originalism, or who is Fred?*, Harvard Journal of Law and Public Policy; Cambridge Vol. 19, Iss. 2, (Winter 1996): 321.
- Attamimi, A. Hamid S., The Role of the Decree of the President of the Republic of

Indonesia in Implementation State Government; A Studies Analysis Regarding Functioning Presidential Decrees Arrangement in The Period of Pelita I–Pelita IV. Dissertation Faculty of Law Postgraduate Program, University of Indonesia. Jakarta: 1990.

______. 1992. Speech Inauguration of Professors. University of Indonesia. Jakarta.

- Irianto, Sulistyiowati. Hacking the Path to Justice For People Marginalized and Women (A Review Socio -Legal). Speech Inauguration of Professor Still in Knowledge Legal Anthropology at the Faculty of Law, University of Indonesia, April 22, 2019.
- Suharto, R.B. (2020). Strengthening the law in order to maintain the existence of the unitary state of the republic of Indonesia. International Journal of Law Reconstruction, 4(1).
- Tan, David., and Lu Sudirman, Final Income Tax: A Classic Contemporary Concept to Increase Voluntary Tax Compliance Among Legal Professions In Indonesia. Journal of Indonesian Legal Studies, Volume 5(1).
- Wignyosoebroto, Soetandyo Without Years, Laws and Methods The study.
- Ratna Sari Dewi Assistant to the Central Indonesian Ombudsman "19 Years of the Ombudsman, Towards "Prime Public Service", https://news.detik.com/kolom/d-4463476/19-tahun-ombudsman-menuju-pelayanan-publik-prima, accessed, March 1, 2023.
- Rody Wahyudi et.al., "Behavior Maladministration Bureaucracy In Public Services in Pekanbaru City, Province Riau: Factor Causes and Solutions", *Journal Public Administration*, No. 1, Volume 12, (2015).
- Sulistyowati Irianto, Hacking the Path to Justice For People Marginalized and Women (A Review *Socio -Legal*). Speech Inauguration of Professor Still in Knowledge Legal Anthropology at the Faculty of Law, University of Indonesia, April 22, 2019.

Regulation Legislation and Other Sources of Law:

1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia (State Gazette No. 75 of 1959).

- Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 37 of 2008 concerning the Ombudsman of the Republic of Indonesia, State Gazette of the Republic of Indonesia Year 2008 Number 139, Supplement to the State Gazette of the Republic of Indonesia Indonesia Number 4899).
- Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 6 of 2014 concerning Village, State Gazette of the Republic of Indonesia Year 2014 Number 7, Supplement to the State Gazette of the Republic of Indonesia Indonesia Number 5495).